### **Political Theories of Work**

POLSCI 701 (Winter 2024) Tuesday 2:00-5:00 pm 5521 Haven Hall

Professor: Ann K. Heffernan

Office Hours: sign up here
Email: akheff@umich.edu

Haven Hall 7632 or by Zoom

#### **OVERVIEW:**

A formal legal status that confers membership in a nation-state, citizenship is often used more loosely to refer to the enjoyment of the rights and entitlements necessary for full inclusion in a community. This understanding of citizenship, articulated most forcefully by T. H. Marshall in his landmark 1949 essay, "Citizenship and Social Class," captures the contradiction between the formal equality that citizenship is meant to secure, and the persistence of marked socioeconomic inequality. Elaborating upon Marshall's analysis of the civil, political, and social dimensions of citizenship, more recent scholarship by Amy Brandzel, Kevin Bruyneel, Juliet Hooker, Cecilia Menjívar, and others has stressed its exclusionary—and even violent—core. This seminar will explore the many and varied meanings of citizenship and the controversies, debates, and challenges it provokes.

## **ASSESSMENT:**

# Attendance and Participation:

25%

I view this class as a collaborative enterprise grounded in engaged discussion and open debate. I understand participation to include not only comments or questions, but the ability to actively listen to your colleagues and thoughtfully and respectfully engage with their ideas.

## **Discussion Leadership**

15%

While I will typically open class with a short lecture to frame the readings and provide some background, you will each be responsible for beginning one class discussion. Typically, this will involve a short (5-7 minute) presentation in which you situate the texts relative to each other and to the overall aims of the course. Think of this as if you are providing discussant comments at a workshop or an academic conference. Your task is **not** to provide a summary (we will have read the texts, after all), but rather to highlight key concepts, areas of confusion, agreement, or conflict between texts. While some readings are in explicit conversation with each other, in some cases the resonances (or points of disagreement) are less obvious. Your remarks should be followed by 2-3 questions to orient the discussion.

Seminar Paper 60%

You will be required to write a seminar paper of 15-20 pages, due electronically to me by 6pm on April 30<sup>th</sup>.

## OTHER POLICIES AND INFORMATION:

**Attendance:** While complete attendance in the class is encouraged, life often has other plans. Most importantly, please stay home if you feel sick (no need to get a doctor's note).

Accessibility: If you have a physical, sensory, cognitive, or psychological disability and require accommodations, please let me know if I can do more to make the class (and class materials) more accessible. You do not have to disclose your disability status in order to request accommodations from me. I do want to know about what kinds of accommodations will make our classroom a productive learning environment for you, but I also want you to know that disclosure is a choice. Disclosure isn't limited to disability status, either: it may come up with respect to past trauma, gender identity, sexuality, etc.

Formal requests for accommodations may be made by contacting the Services for Students with Disabilities (SSD) Office located at G664 Haven Hall. While I do not require you to have completed a formal request with the SSD Office, it can be helpful for accessing resources (OCR PDFs, for example).

**Student Well-Being**: Students may experience stressors that can impact both their academic experience and their personal well-being. These may include academic pressure and challenges associated with relationships, mental health, alcohol or other drugs, identities, finances, etc.

If you are experiencing any issues, seeking help is a courageous thing to do for yourself and those who care about you. If the source of your stressors is academic, please contact me so that we can find solutions together. For personal concerns, U-M offers many resources, some of which are listed at <u>Resources for Student Well-being</u> on the Well-being for U-M Students website. You can also search for additional resources on that website.

Academic Honesty and Integrity: The University of Michigan community functions best when its members treat one another with honesty, fairness, respect, and trust. The college promotes the assumption of personal responsibility and integrity and prohibits all forms of academic dishonesty and misconduct. For more information, including examples of behaviors that are considered academic misconduct and potential sanctions, please see <a href="mailto:lsa.umich.edu/lsa/academics/academic-integrity.html">lsa.umich.edu/lsa/academics/academic-integrity.html</a>

**Contacting me:** I am here to be a resource for you. **Do** take advantage of my office hours, and feel free to email me at any point with questions or concerns. I will try to reply to emails within 24 hours. You can sign up for office hours <a href="here">here</a>. If there are no times available that work with your schedule, please email me and we'll figure something out.

**Note on texts:** All readings are available on Canvas under the "Modules" tab; however, you may wish to have the following texts on hand:

#### COURSE SCHEDULE

(Please complete the readings in the order listed)

# January 16th: Introduction

# January 23<sup>rd</sup>: The Myth of Citizenship, or: Some Efforts at Definition

- Linda Bosniak, "Defining Citizenship: Substance, Locations, and Subjects," in *The Citizen and the Alien: Dilemmas of Contemporary Membership* (Princeton University Press, 2006), pp. 17-36.
- J. G. A. Pocock, "The Ideal of Citizenship Since Classical Times," in *Citizenship: Critical Concepts in Political Science*, eds. Richard Bellamy and Madeleine Kennedy-Macfoy (Routledge, 2014), pp. 67-85.
- Ryan Balot, "Revising the Classical Ideal of Citizenship," in *The Oxford Handbook of Citizenship*, eds. Ayelet Shachar, Rainer Bauböck, Irene Bloemraad, and Maarten Vink (Oxford, 2017), pp. 15-35.
- Linda Bosniak, "Persons and Citizens in Constitutional Thought," *International Journal of Constitutional Thought* 8, no. 1 (2010), pp. 9-29.

## Optional:

- Aristotle, *Politics*, ed. C. D. C. Reeve (Hackett Publishing, 1998), Book III and Book VII, Chaps. 7-10.

## January 30<sup>th</sup>: Marshallian Citizenship

- T. H. Marshall, Citizenship and Social Class, ed. Tom Bottomore (Pluto Press, 1992), pp. 3-51.
- Margaret R. Somers, "Rights, Relationality, and Membership: Rethinking the Making and Meaning of Citizenship," *Law and Social Inquiry* 19, no. 1 (1994): pp. 63-112.
- Nancy Fraser and Linda Gordon, "Civil Citizenship Against Social Citizenship? On the Ideology of Contract-Versus-Charity," in *The Condition of Citizenship*, ed. Bart van Steenbergen (Sage, 1996), pp. 90-107.

## February 6<sup>th</sup>: Moving Beyond the Nation-State?

- Craig Calhoun, "Is It Time to Be Postnational?" in *Nations Matter: Culture, History, and the Cosmopolitan Dream* (Routledge, 2007), pp. 11-26.
- Rogers Brubaker, "Migration, Membership, and the Nation-State," in *Grounds for Difference* (Harvard University Press, 2015), pp. 131-144.
- Jon E. Fox and Cynthia Miller-Idriss, "Everyday Nationhood," *Ethnicities* 8, no. 4 (2008), pp. 536-576.

<u>Note</u>: This piece was part of a dialogue in *Ethnicities* with Anthony Smith. I have included the piece by Smith (as well as Fox and Miller-Idriss's response) on Canvas for reference, though neither are required.

- Michaela DeSoucey, "Gastronationalism: Food Traditions and Authenticity Politics in the European Union," *American Sociological Review* 75, no. 3 (2010), pp. 432-455.
- Lauren Berlant, "The Theory of Infantile Citizenship," in *The Queen of America Goes to Washington City: Essays on Sex and Citizenship* (Duke University Press, 1997), pp. 25-54.

#### Recommended:

- Arjun Appadurai, "Patriotism and Its Futures," *Public Culture* 5 (1993), pp. 411-429.
- Michael Billig, Banal Nationalism (Sage, 1995).

- Rogers Brubaker, "National Minorities, National States, and External National Homelands in the New Europe," *Daedalus* 124, no. 2 (Spring 1995), pp. 107-132.
- Yasemin Nuhoğlu Soysal, "Toward a Postnational Model of Membership," in *Limits of Citizenship: Migrants and Post national Membership in Europe* (University of Chicago Press, 1994), pp. 136-162.

## February 13<sup>th</sup>: The Romance of Transnationality

- Michel Foucault, "1 February 1978," Security, Territory, Population: Lectures at the Collège de France, 1977-1978, ed. Michel Senellart, trans. Graham Burchell (Picador, 2007), pp. 87-114.
- Aihwa Ong, Flexible Citizenship: The Cultural Logics of Transnationality (Duke University Press, 1999); pp. 1-24, 110-138.
- Neha Vora, "Between Global City and Golden Frontier: Indian Businessmen, Unofficial Citizenship, and Shifting Forms of Belonging," in *Impossible Citizens: Dubai's Indian Diaspora* (Duke University Press, 2013), pp. 91-116.
- Matthew B. Sparke, "A Neoliberal Nexus: Economy, Security, and the Biopolitics of Citizenship on the Border," *Political Geography* 25, no. 2 (February 2006), pp.151-180.

## Recommended:

- Tim Cresswell, "Toward a Politics of Mobility," *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 28 (2010), pp. 17-31.
- Inderpal Grewal, Transnational America: Feminisms Diasporas, Neoliberalisms (Duke University Press, 2005).
- Kimberly Kay Hoang, Dealing in Desire: Asian Ascendancy, Western Decline, and the Hidden Currencies of Global Sex Work (University of California Press, 2015).
- Aiwha Ong, Neoliberalism as Exception: Mutations in Citizenship and Sovereignty (Duke University Press, 2006).
- Kerilyn Schewel, "Understanding Immobility: Moving Beyond the Mobility Bias in Migration Studies" *International Migration Review* 54, no. 2 (2019), pp. 328-355.

## February 20th: Caring Economies, Service Work, and Liminal Citizenship

- Cecilia Menjívar, "Liminal Legality: Salvadoran and Guatemalan Immigrants' Lives in the United States," *American Journal of Sociology* 111, no. 4 (January 2006), pp. 999-1037.
- Thurka Sangaramoorthy, "Liminal Living: Everyday Injury, Disability, and Instability among Migrant Mexican Women in Maryland's Seafood Industry," *Medical Anthropology Quarterly* 33, no. 4 (2019), pp. 557-578.
- Lalaie Ameeriar, "Pedagogies of Affect: Docility and Deference in the Making of Immigrant Women Subjects," *Signs* 40, no. 2 (2015), pp. 467-486.
- Rachel H. Brown, "Reproducing the National Family: Kinship Claims, Development Discourse and Migrant Caregivers in Palestine/Israel," *Feminist Theory* 20, no. 3 (2019): pp. 247-268.

# February 27<sup>th</sup>: No Class (Spring Break)

## March 5<sup>th</sup>: Reconstructing White Citizenship

- W. E. B. Du Bois, "The Black Worker," and "The White Worker," in *Black Reconstruction* (Routledge, 2017) pp. 1-27.
- Joel Olson, "The Problem of the White Citizen," in *The Abolition of White Democracy* (University of Minnesota Press, 2004), pp. 31-63.

- Cristina Beltrán, Cruelty as Citizenship: How Migrant Suffering Sustains White Democracy (University of Minnesota Press, 2020); pp. 1-31, 91-124.
- Juliet Hooker, "Black Protest and Democratic Sacrifice," in *Black Grief/White Grievance: The Politics of Loss* (Princeton University Press, 2023), pp. 83-126.

#### Recommended:

- Eric Foner, "The Meaning of Freedom in the Age of Emancipation," *Journal of American History* (September 1994), pp. 435-460.
- Evelyn Nakano Glenn, *Unequal Freedom: How Race and Gender Shaped American Citizenship and Labor* (Harvard University Press, 2002).
- Aziz Rana, The Two Faces of American Freedom (Harvard University Press, 2010).
- Judith Shklar, American Citizenship: The Quest for Inclusion (Harvard University Press, 1991).
- Rogers Smith, "Beyond Tocqueville, Myrdal, and Hartz: The Multiple Traditions in America," *APSR* 87, no. 3 (1993), pp. 549-66.

## March 12th: (Re)constituting the Border Through Difference, Part I: Deviance and Citizenship

- Nancy Fraser and Linda Gordon, "A Genealogy of Dependency: Tracing a Keyword of the U.S. Welfare State," *Signs* 19, no. 2 (Winter 1994), pp. 309-336.
- Nayan Shah, "Between 'Oriental Depravity' and 'Natural Degenerates': Spatial Borderlands and the Making of Ordinary Americans," *American Quarterly* 57, no. 3 (Sept. 2005), pp. 703-725.
- Ryan Lee Cartwright, "Sissies, Loafers, and the Feebleminded: Disability and Nonheteronormativity in Rural White Eugenic Family Studies," *GLQ* 28, no. 4 (2022), pp. 515-540.
- Nancy Cott, "Marriage and Women's Citizenship in the United States, 1830-1934," *American Historical Review* 5 (1998), pp. 1440-1474.
- Amy L. Brandzel, "Queering Citizenship: Same-Sex Marriage and the State," *GLQ* 11, no. 2 (2005), pp. 171-204.

## Recommended

- Douglas Baynton, "Disability and the Justification of Inequality in American History," in *The New Disability History: American Perspectives*, eds. Paul K. Longmore and Lauri Umansky (NYU Press, 2001), pp. 33-57.
- Allison C. Carey, On the Margins of Citizenship: Intellectual Disability and Civil Rights in Twentieth Century America (Temple University Press, 2009).
- Jay Dolmage, "Disabled Upon Arrival: The Rhetorical Construction of Disability and Race at Ellis Island," *Cultural Critique* 77 (Winter 2011), pp. 24-69.
- Molly Ladd-Taylor, Fixing the Poor: Eugenic Sterilization and Child Welfare in the Twentieth Century (Johns Hopkins University Press, 2017).
- Beth Lew-Williams, "'Chinamen' and 'Delinquent Girls': Intimacy, Exclusion, and a Search for California's Color Line," *Journal of American History* (December 2017), pp. 632-655.
- Susan Schweik, The Ugly Laws: Disability in Public (NYU Press, 2009).

## March 19<sup>th</sup>: Constructing Illegality

- Linda Bosniak, "Status Non-Citizens," in *The Oxford Handbook*, eds. Ayelet Shachar et al. (Oxford, 2017), pp. 314-336.
- Nicholas P. De Genova, "Migrant 'Illegality' and Deportability in Everyday Life," *Annual Review of Anthropology* 31 (2002), pp. 419-447.

- Mae Ngai, "Braceros, Wetbacks,' and the National Boundaries of Class," in *Impossible Subjects: Illegal Aliens and the Making of Modern America* (Princeton University Press, 2004), pp. 127-166.
- Natalie Cisneros, "Alien Sexuality: Race, Maternity, and Citizenship," *Hypatia* 28, no. 2 (Spring 2013), pp. 290-306.
- Brittany R. Leach, "At the Borders of the Body Politic: Fetal Citizens, Pregnant Migrants, and Reproductive Injustices in Immigration Detention," *American Political Science Review* 116, no. 1 (Feb. 2022), pp. 116-130.

### Recommended

- Lauren Berlant, "America, Fat, the Fetus," in *The Queen of America Goes to Washington City: Essays on Sex and Citizenship* (Duke University Press, 1997), pp. 83-144.
- René D. Flores and Ariela Schachter, "Who Are the 'Illegals'? The Social Construction of Illegality in the United States," *American Sociological Review* 83, no. 5 (2018), pp. 839-68.
- Nicholas D. Genova, "The Legal Production of Mexican/Migrant 'Illegality," *Latino Studies* 2 (2004), pp. 160-185.
- Bonnie Honig, Democracy and the Foreigner (Princeton University Press, 2001).
- Eithne Luibhéid, *Pregnant on Arrival: Making the Illegal Immigrant* (University of Minnesota Press, 2013).

## March 26<sup>th</sup>: Refusing Citizenship

- Leti Volpp, "The Indigenous as Alien," UC Irvine Law Review 5, no. 289 (2015), pp. 776-809.
- Audra Simpson, "Paths Toward a Mohawk Nation: Narratives of Citizenship and Nationhood in Kahnawake," in *Political Theory and the Rights of Indigenous Peoples*, eds. Duncan Ivison, Paul Patton, and Will Sanders (Cambridge University Press, 2000), pp. 113-36.
- Kevin Bruyneel, "Indigenous Politics and the 'Gift' of U.S. Citizenship in the Early Twentieth Century," in *The Third Space of Sovereignty* (University of Minnesota Press, 2007), pp. 97-121.
- David Myer Temin, "Custer's Sins: Vine Deloria Jr. and the Settler-Colonial Politics of Civic Inclusion," *Political Theory* 46, no. 3 (2017), pp. 357-379.
- Audra Simpson, "The Ruse of Consent and the Anatomy of Refusal: Cases from Indigenous North America and Australia," *Postcolonial Studies* 20, no. 1 (2017), pp. 18-33.

#### Recommended:

- Anne Bonds and Joshua Inwood, "Beyond White Privilege: Geographies of White Supremacy and Settler Colonialism," *Progress in Human Geography* 40, no. 6 (December 2016), pp. 713-733.
- Jodi Byrd, *The Transit of Empire: Indigenous Critiques of Colonialism* (University of Minnesota Press, 2011).
- Danika Cooper, "Legacies of Violence: Citizenship and Sovereignty on Contested Lands," Landscape Citizenships, ed. Tim Waterman, Jane Wolff, Ed Wall (Routledge, 2021), pp. 225-252.
- Adam Dahl, *Empire of the People* (University Press of Kansas, 2018).
- Philip J. Deloria, "American Master Narratives and the Problem of Indian Citizenship in the Gilded Age and Progressive Era," *The Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era* 14 (2015), pp. 3-12.

# April 2<sup>nd</sup>: Fantasies of Identification

- Adriana Petryna, *Life Exposed: Biological Citizens after Chernobyl* (Princeton University Press, 2002), selections.
- Nikolas Rose, "Biological Citizens," in *The Politics of Life Itself: Biomedicine, Power, and Subjectivity in the Twenty-First Century* (Princeton University Press, 2008), pp. 131-154.
- Kim TallBear, Native American DNA: Tribal Belonging and the False Promise of Genetic Science (University of Minnesota Press, 2013), selections.
- Marion Fourcade, "Ordinal Citizenship," British Journal of Sociology 72 (2021), pp. 154-173.

### Recommended:

- Nadia Abu El-Haj, "The Genetic Reinscription of Race," *Annual Review of Anthropology* 36 (2007), pp. 283-300.
- Deborah Heath, Rayna Rapp, and Karen-Sue Taussig, "Genetic Citizenship," A Companion to the Anthropology of Politics, eds. David Nugent and Joan Vincent (Blackwell, 2007), pp. 152-167
- J. Kēhaulani Kauanui, *Hawaiian Blood: Colonialism and the Politics of Sovereignty and Indigeneity* (Duke University Press, 2008).
- Alondra Nelson, *The Social Life of DNA: Race, Reparations, and Reconciliation After the Genome* (Beacon Press, 2016).
- Dorothy Roberts, Fatal Invention: How Science, Politics, and Big Business Re-Create Race in the Twentieth Century (New Press, 2011).
- Ellen Samuels, Fantasies of Identification: Disability, Gender, Race (NYU Press, 2014).

## April 9th: Medicalized Citizenship

- Dean Spade, "Resisting Medicine, Re/modeling Gender," Berkeley Women's Law Journal 18, no. 1 (2003), pp. 15-37.
- Helena Hansen, Philippe Bourgois, Ernest Drucker, "Pathologizing Poverty: New Forms of Diagnosis, Disability, and Structural Stigma Under Welfare Reform," Social Science and Medicine 103 (Feb. 2014), pp. 76-83.
- Craig Konnoth, "Medicalization and the New Civil Rights," *Stanford Law Review* 72 (May 2020), pp. 1165-1267.
- Jamila Michener, Fragmented Democracy: Medicaid, Federalism, and Unequal Politics (Cambridge University Press, 2018), selections.
- Joel Achenbach et al., "An Epidemic of Chronic Illness is Killing Us Too Soon," Washington Post, October 3, 2023,
   <a href="https://www.washingtonpost.com/health/interactive/2023/american-life-expectancy-dropping/">https://www.washingtonpost.com/health/interactive/2023/american-life-expectancy-dropping/</a>.

#### Recommended

- João Biehl, "The Activist State: Global Pharmaceuticals, AIDS, and Citizenship in Brazil," *Social Text* 22, no. 3 (Fall 2004)
- Michelle Murphy, Sick Building Syndrome and the Problem of Uncertainty: Environmental Politics, Technoscience, and Women Workers (Duke University Press, 2006).
- Angela Garcia, The Pastoral Clinic: Addiction and Dispossession Along the Rio Grande (University of California Press, 2010).

# April 16<sup>th</sup>: Propertied Citizenship

- Alex Jeffrey, Colin McFarlane, Alex Vasudevan, "Rethinking Enclosure: Space, Subjectivity, and the Commons," 44, no. 4 (September 2012), pp. 1247-1267.
- Ananya Roy, "Paradigms of Propertied Citizenship: Transnational Techniques of Analysis," *Urban Affairs Review* 38, no. 4 (March 2003), pp. 463-91.
- Malini Ranganathan, "Paying for Pipes, Claiming Citizenship: Political Agency and Water Reforms at the Urban Periphery," *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research* 38, no. 2 (March 2014), pp. 590-608.
- Chris Herring, "Complaint-Oriented Policing: Regulating Homelessness in Public Space," American Sociological Review 84, no. 5 (2019), pp. 769-800.
- Ayelet Shachar, "Against Birthright Privilege: Redefining Citizenship as Property," in *Identities, Affiliations, and Allegiances,* eds. Seyla Benhabib, Ian Shapiro, and Danilo Petranovich (Cambridge University Press, 2007), pp. 257-82.

## Recommended:

- James Holston, Insurgent Citizenship: Disjunctions of Democracy and Modernity in Brazil (Princeton University Press, 2008).
- Aileen Moreton-Robinson, *The White Possessive: Property, Power, and Indigenous Sovereignty* (University of Minnesota Press, 2015).
- Shiri Pasternak, "How Capitalism Will Save Colonialism: The Privatization of Reserve Lands in Canada" *Antipode* 47, no. 1 (2015), pp. 179-196.
- Stephen Przbylinski, "Realizing Citizenship in Property: Houseless Encampments and the Limits of Liberalism's Promise," *Political Geography* 91 (2021).
- Sara Safransky, The City After Property: Abandonment and Repair in Postindustrial Detroit (Duke University Press, 2023).

## April 24th: Imagining Home: Citizenship in a Minor Key

- Iris Marion Young, "House and Home: Feminist Variations on a Theme," and "A Room of One's Own," in *On Female Body Experience: "Throwing Like a Girl" and Other Essays* (Oxford University Press, 2005), pp. 123-170.
- Harriet McBryde Johnson, "The Disability Gulag," in *New York Times Magazine*, November 23, 2003.
- Hagar Kotef, *The Colonizing Self: Or, Home and Homelessness in Israel/Palestine* (Duke University Press, 2020), selections.

#### Recommended:

- Marco Antonsich, "Searching for Belonging—An Analytical Framework," *Geography Compass* 4, no. 6 (June 2010), pp. 644-659.
- hell hooks, Belonging: A Culture of Place (Routledge, 2009).
- Krishan Kumar and Ekaterina Makarova, "The Portable Home: The Domestication of Public Space," *Sociological Theory* 26, no. 4 (2008).
- Nira Yuval-Davis, "Belonging and the Politics of Belonging," *Patterns of Prejudice* 40, no. 3 (2006), pp. 197-214.